

EVALUATING ARGUMENTS

Analyzing Authors' Claims

KEY
STANDARD
RI.6-8.8

Read “Should Sodas Have Warning Labels?” (pp. 22-23), then use the prompts below to analyze each author’s claim and decide who you think makes a stronger case.

AUTHOR: Elizabeth Velten Director of State Policy, Public Health Advocates	AUTHOR: Lisa D. Katic Registered dietitian, K Consulting
Author’s main claim or argument in the debate:	Author’s main claim or argument in the debate:
REASON 1: Cite one reason the author gives for her claim. List evidence the author gives to support REASON 1 .	REASON 1: Cite one reason the author gives for her claim. List evidence the author gives to support REASON 1 .
REASON 2: Cite another reason the author presents. List evidence the author gives to support REASON 2 .	REASON 2: Cite another reason the author presents. List evidence the author gives to support REASON 2 .
Which persuasive devices does the author use? ____ Appeals to emotions ____ Uses data or scholarly research ____ Explains why the other side’s argument is weak ____ Other: _____	Which persuasive devices does the author use? ____ Appeals to emotions ____ Uses data or scholarly research ____ Explains why the other side’s argument is weak ____ Other: _____

Evaluate Which author do you think makes her case more effectively? Do you spot any weaknesses—such as bias or missing information—in either author’s argument? Explain your answers on a separate sheet of paper.